Reading Material-Based Content Analysis in Senior High School English Textbooks in Indonesia

Cicih Nuraeni1*, Didi Sukyadi2, Fazri Nur Yusuf3
Universitas Pendidikan Indonesia1,2,3
Jl. Dr. Setiabudhi No. 229, Isola, Kec. Sukasari
Kota Bandung, Jawa Barat 401541,2,3;
Universitas Bina Sarana Informatika1
Jalan Kramat Raya No. 98, Senen, Jakarta Pusat
104501*;
cicihccn@upi.edu1*
* corresponding author

Received: 23 February 2023
Revised: 6 June 2023
Accepted: 31 July 2023
Published: 31 July 2023

Abstract
English textbooks play a vital role in providing students with language learning input in class activities. Unfortunately, the selection and evaluation of English textbooks has often received insufficient attention and thought. Content such as reading material receives less attention than layout analysis, design, and cultural understanding. The purpose of this study is to investigate the extent to which reading material cover the genres and skills presented in senior high school English textbooks in Indonesia. The qualitative-based content analysis method was used in this study. There were three English textbooks observed, namely those for grades 10, 11, and 12 published by Ministry of Education and Culture in Indonesia. The aspects observed in reading materials include reading genres and skills based on Brown's theory. The study discovered textbooks are dominated by personal reading with 17 reading material and 14 academic materials. Meanwhile, job-related reading is limited to class 10 textbooks. When it comes to reading skills, macroskills take precedence over microskills. Furthermore, based on these findings it can be concluded that the textbooks need to be developed to provide a balanced portion of reading genres and skills in each chapter. The limitations and suggestions are further discussed.

Keywords: content analysis, English textbook, reading material, senior high school, textbook analysis

Introduction
In recent years, in Indonesia, textbooks have become one of the most widely debated issues among many parties, particularly in terms of content. The quality of textbooks as a vital part of the learning process has a significant impact on the achievement of learning objectives (Pan & Chen, 2020). The availability of quality textbooks will help the success of the learning process (Hanifa, 2018). A good textbook must be relevant to the curriculum and help in curriculum implementation (Li, 2020; Ayu & Indrawati, 2019). The current textbooks used in Indonesia are
based on the 2013 National Curriculum. In its use, the facts show that there are numerous issues about textbooks in the classroom. Previous researches have shown that existing English textbooks do not meet the criteria for good textbooks and do not focus on needs analysis (Nesi, Su, & Pristiwati, 2022). Other previous research findings demonstrate that English textbooks only meet the design and layout criteria (Rahma, Aampa, & Nappu, 2021; Said, 2018). However, weaknesses were discovered, such as a lack of language skills, activities, and assignments (Munir, Suzanne, & Yulnetri, 2021; Sari, 2016). This condition is thought to be one of the causes of the evaluation of textbooks (Lama, Sejdiu, & Bilalli, 2021; Putri, Herawati, & Rahmah, 2021; Rinekso, 2021).

Aside from the previously mentioned above, the discussion of content analysis in English textbooks is also essential. Previous researchers focused only on cultural contents rather than reading material (Sulistiyo, Wulan, Al Arif, Efriza, & Anwar, 2021; Fata, Gani & Husna, 2020; Ayu, 2020; Setyono & Widodo, 2019; Sadeghi, & Sepahi, 2018). The discussion about reading material includes discussions of reading genres and reading skills is still limited. The evaluation of reading material in the English textbook will be beneficial because it has a greatly influences on students’ understanding and learning experience (Rokhansyah, Nuryatin, Supriyianto, & Setyaningsih, 2021; Paige, Young, Rasinski, Rupley, Nichols & Valerio, 2021; Adanan, Adanan & Herawan, 2020; Erfiani, Ngadiso & Suparno, 2019; Dakhi & Damanik, 2018; Ameyaw & Anto, 2018). Hence, the use of English textbooks must be in line with the educational objectives and suitable to enhance students' language skills (Sesmiyanti, Antika & Suharni, 2021). Textbooks contain main components of learning materials about a specific field of science. It can be used as a guide for teachers and students in learning activities. (Stevani & Tarigan, 2022, Elmiana, 2018; Nurhamsih, 2017). Brown states that textbooks should fit the goals, objectives, and contents of the curriculum (Brown, 1995). To put it another way, textbooks and curriculum must complement one another with the aim of helping teachers and students in the learning process (Guilani, 2022 ; Hakim, Setyaningsih & Cahyaningrum, 2021).

Apart from being related to the main components of the textbook, the reading material in English textbook is also closely related to reading genre and reading skills (Brown, 2003). Brown describes that there are 3 (three types) of genre of the reading they are: (1) Academic Reading, includes technical reports, general interest article on newspaper/magazines, professional journal articles, reference material, textbooks, theses, and essays. (2) Job-related Reading, includes letters/emails, memos, project reports, schedules, applications, questionnaires, and financial documents. (3) Personal Reading, includes greeting cards, invitations, messages, lists schedules (train, bus, phone, etcetera), recipes, menus, maps, calendars, advertisements commercials, novels, short stories, jokes, drama, poetry, and medical reports. Meanwhile, micro and macroskills are also important in reading skills, particularly when it comes to comprehending a text. Knowing the writing system, phonemes, words (vocabulary), phrasal units, and grammatical classes are all microskills related to the reading process. Furthermore, macroskills are associated with the ability to comprehend both general and specific information. Along with proficiency in comprehension, reading style, reading strategy and cohesion (Mantra, Widiastuti & Pramawati, 2020; Brown, 2003).
In fact, reading material in English textbooks remains an aspect that has received less attention from various parties in Indonesia. Reading content, which should also be emphasized in textbooks, has not yet become the primary focus. Many researchers are only concerned with other aspects of textbooks, such as cultural content, layout, and performance, regardless of the genres and skills covered.

To fill the gap, this study focuses on evaluating English textbooks on reading material based on content analysis using Brown's theory of reading genres and skills (Brown, 2003) as the underpinning theory. Senior high school English textbooks for grades 10, 11, and 12 will be examined.

**Method**

The main data for this study are English textbooks published by the Ministry of Education and Culture of the Republic of Indonesia for high school students in classes 10 to 12. These textbooks are used in Indonesian public senior high schools. To obtain more specific data, the researchers are concentrating on gathering information and collecting data about the reading material contained in those three English textbooks. The data for the textbooks that will be analyzed are as follows:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>No.</th>
<th>Book Title</th>
<th>Number of Chapters/Pages</th>
<th>Authors</th>
<th>Publication Year</th>
<th>Publisher</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>Bahasa Inggris Tingkat Lanjut SMA Kelas XI</td>
<td>8 Chapters/170 pages</td>
<td>Makhruh Basir</td>
<td>2017</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Data Collecting Procedure
Since the researchers decided to conduct an in-depth analysis of the content of reading materials in English textbooks for classes 10 to 12, the researchers started by reading English textbooks thoroughly. Then, the researchers observed and comprehended the contents of each English textbook, particularly the reading materials. The researcher listed the topics and materials from each English textbook, focusing on reading genre and skill to determine whether it meets the quality criteria or not. Finally, the researcher divided this study into reading genres and skills based on Brown's theory of reading genres and skills (Brown, 2003).

Data Analysis
Content analysis is used in this study as the main method in data analysis. It is a method of analyzing the content of textbook materials, which include written, spoken, and visual elements used as a medium of communication between teachers and students in the learning process. Additionally, researchers use content analysis to better understanding and explaining information in detail (Krippendorff, 2018). The analysis is organized by class, beginning with class 10 books and progressing to class 11 and finally class 12. Reading material content data gathered from the results of this book analysis are divided into chapters, titles, pages, genres of reading and skills. In each chapter of the three textbooks above, the researchers will narrow the analysis of the reading genre and skills of the reading material. Then the entire data set will be explained in the findings and discussion section.

Findings and Discussions
Based on the results of observations and overviews of the three textbooks, information has been obtained that an English textbook for class 10 has 15 chapters, an English textbook for class 11 has 8 chapters, and an English textbook for class 12 has 11 chapters. The researchers have conducted a content analysis of senior high school English textbooks, which is divided into two main analyses, namely genre of the reading and reading skills. Tables below will present detailed information related to reading material-based content analysis.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Chapter</th>
<th>Title</th>
<th>Pages</th>
<th>Genres of Reading</th>
<th>Skills</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>Talking about Self</td>
<td>3-8</td>
<td>Personal Reading</td>
<td>Macroskills</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>Congratulating and Complimenting Others</td>
<td>23-25</td>
<td>Personal Reading</td>
<td>Microskills</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Based on the results of the analysis of class 10 English textbooks, the data shown in Table 2 inform that the reading material contains reading genres and skills. Within the genre of the reading section, there are 7 academic readings, 6 personal readings and 2 Job-related readings. Furthermore, in the skills analysis section, there are 6 that are included in the category of macroskills and 9 microskills. Another finding in this textbook is that only 14 of the 15 chapters examined contain reading material. This means that there is one chapter with no reading section.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Chapter</th>
<th>Title</th>
<th>Pages</th>
<th>Genres of Reading</th>
<th>Skills</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>Natural Disaster-An Exposition</td>
<td>46</td>
<td>Academic Reading</td>
<td>Microskills</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>Letter Writing</td>
<td>62</td>
<td>Personal Reading</td>
<td>Macroskills</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8</td>
<td>Explain This!!</td>
<td>100</td>
<td>Academic Reading</td>
<td>Microskills</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Enrichment 1</td>
<td>Can Greed Ever be Satisfied? Bullying: A Cancer that Must be Eradicated</td>
<td>115-120</td>
<td>Personal Reading</td>
<td>Microskills</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Enrichment 2</td>
<td>Hopes and Dreams!</td>
<td>123-126</td>
<td>Academic Reading</td>
<td>Macroskills</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Enrichment 3</td>
<td>Vanity, what is thy price?</td>
<td>129-132</td>
<td>Academic Reading</td>
<td>Macroskills</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Enrichment 4</td>
<td>Benefit of Doubt</td>
<td>135-142</td>
<td>Personal Reading</td>
<td>Macroskills</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Enrichment 5</td>
<td>The Last Leaf</td>
<td>145-150</td>
<td>Personal Reading</td>
<td>Macroskills</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Enrichment 6</td>
<td>Father of Indonesia Education</td>
<td>153-157</td>
<td>Personal Reading</td>
<td>Microskills</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Enrichment 7</td>
<td></td>
<td>160-163</td>
<td>Academic Reading</td>
<td>Macroskills</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Table 3 shows that reading material is only listed in three chapters. This textbook adds reading material to 7 (seven) enrichment sections which supplement the reading material in the three chapters mentioned above. There are 5 academic readings and 5 personal readings in the reading genre section. However, none of the reading is classified as job-related reading. This Class 11 English textbook provides 6 (six) macros and 4 (four) micros for the skills section.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Chapter</th>
<th>Title</th>
<th>Pages</th>
<th>Genres of Reading</th>
<th>Skills</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>Why Don't You Visit Seattle?</td>
<td>18-23</td>
<td>Personal Reading</td>
<td>Macroskills</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Microskills</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>Creating Captions</td>
<td>32-39</td>
<td>Personal Reading</td>
<td>Macroskills</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>Do You Know How to Apply for a Job</td>
<td>50-51</td>
<td>Personal Reading</td>
<td>Macroskills</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>Who Was Involved?</td>
<td>64-69</td>
<td>Academic Reading</td>
<td>Microskills</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6</td>
<td>Online School Registration</td>
<td>83-87</td>
<td>Academic Reading</td>
<td>Macroskills</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7</td>
<td>It's Garbage In, Art Works Out</td>
<td>99-102</td>
<td>Personal Reading</td>
<td>Macroskills</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9</td>
<td>Do it Carefully!</td>
<td>120-128</td>
<td>Personal Reading</td>
<td>Microskills</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10</td>
<td>How to Use Photoshop?</td>
<td>140-143</td>
<td>Personal Reading</td>
<td>Macroskills</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The textbook class 12 has 11 chapters, but only 8 of them contain reading material. So, the content analysis is limited to those eight chapters. Based on table 4 above, the analysis of the content of reading materials in English textbooks for class 12 shows that there are 5 personal readings and 2 academic readings. While, in the reading skill data section, macroskills outnumber microskills 7 to 3.

To summarize the data findings, the following data recap is based on the analysis of the content of high school English textbooks:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>No.</th>
<th>Book Titles</th>
<th>Reading Genres</th>
<th>Reading Skills</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>Bahasa Inggris SMA/MA/SMK/MAK Kelas X</td>
<td>7 Academic Reading</td>
<td>6 Macroskills</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>6 Personal Reading</td>
<td>9 Microskills</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>2 Job-related Reading</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>Bahasa Inggris Tingkat Lanjut SMA Kelas XI</td>
<td>5 Academic Reading</td>
<td>6 Macroskills</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>5 Personal Reading</td>
<td>4 Microskills</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td></td>
<td>2 Academic Reading</td>
<td>7 Macroskills</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>5 Personal Reading</td>
<td>3 Microskills</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
According to the data findings summary above, reading material for class 10 English textbooks includes reading genres and skills, both macro and microskills. In terms of reading genre analysis, this class 10 English textbook focuses on academic reading genres. This book contains a lot of reading material related to academic reading and personal reading. In addition to academic and personal reading, this class 10 textbook covers a wide range of job-related reading genres. Whereas, in terms of reading skill analysis, microskills are presented more than macroskills. In other words, this class 10 textbook focuses on students' reading comprehension on the micro components.

Then, it is followed by a content analysis of textbooks for class 11, in which the genre of reading and reading skills are well presented. This book combines academic and personal reading. However, there is no reading material classified as job-related reading. Meanwhile, macroskills predominate in the class 11 textbook, while microskills predominate in the class X textbook. Based on these findings, it is reasonable to expect students to be able to develop their skills in macro components. One of these abilities is the ability to extract general and specific information from a text.

In the class 12 English textbook, personal reading now takes larger portion over academic reading. This textbook excludes reading material from job-related reading genres. In reading skills, in line with the class 11 textbook, the focus is on macroskills rather than microskills. Furthermore, class 12 students are expected to continue to improve their macro component reading skills. However, this does not mean that microskills should be ignored.

This study examined the reading genres and skills in three English textbooks for senior high school students that are currently utilized in Indonesian public schools. This section analyzes the results of each reading genre and skill identified in the three English textbooks and answers the research question.

**Reading Genres Portrayed in the Textbooks**

The first reading genre analyzed was academic reading with a high proportion presented on class 10 textbooks, followed by class 11 and 12 textbooks (as can be seen on table 5). In the class 10 textbook, academic reading is offered to students in the form of newspaper articles with a historical topic. It includes historical sites, individuals, and events. Academic reading in the class 10 textbook enables students to recognize and comprehend the significance of history. Whereas in class 11 textbooks, academic reading takes the form of brief essays that are pieces of scientific writing. Students are taught how to interpret reading information in terms of real-world challenges or actual issues. The actual topic covered in this reading material is bullying. This is a really popular and intriguing topic. Students are required to grasp and analyses the topic, as well as think critically about it. Aside from short essays, there is another type of academic reading in the form of opinion writing, which is mostly centered on the writer's point of view. This structure is excellent for eliciting students' critical thinking skills when it comes to capturing
the essence of opinion writing. Despite the fact that opinion writing is generally subjective. It is not founded on exact facts, but rather on the author's feelings and interpretation of the facts. Its existence in academic reading, on the other hand, provides a challenge and enrichment. Aside from that, this class 11 textbook includes newspaper stories regarding extracts from President Soekarno's address that include hopes and dreams, as well as a little political knowledge. Finally, an essay excerpt about the figure of Ki Hajar Dewantoro, complete with his educational motivation and biography. This class 11 textbook can be viewed as focusing on increasing academic reading abilities in many versions. The level and depth of reading content provided to students grows, and new experiences with fact-based text types are provided. As a result, students' reasoning abilities remind them a lot about studying the text and adjusting it to the facts. The weakness of this class 11 textbook is that only three of the eight chapters offer reading content. Even though there is a lot of reading material in the 7 (seven) Enrichment sections, it would be great if all of the chapters in this textbook had reading content as well. This can be used as feedback and ideas for textbook developers while preparing the most recent version of English textbooks for senior high schools. Next, the academic reading genre in class 12 English textbooks is then examined. Despite the fact that just two academic reading resources were discovered, the majority of the material content was appropriate for class 12. This is considered the most significant genre of reading since it introduces a large amount of reading material with greater academic debate, which is beneficial to students' insights. The form of academic reading in the class 12 textbook is similar to class 10 textbook, namely the article. The distinction is in the level of difficulty of the reading content. Class 10 reading materials provide a wide range of themes on historical locations, individuals, and events, with content that is straightforward for students to understand. Meanwhile, in the class 12 textbook, the articles offered are more tough in terms of news items. The story is based on both articles from newspapers and television. The amount of material reading with the academic reading genre looks to be pretty adequate for students. One of the reasons, this is considered quite acceptable is that students may progressively enhance their knowledge in grasping the content included in the reading material. In brief, the quantity of reading material offered for the academic reading genre is generally found in class 10 textbooks, while numerous varieties such as short essays, scientific writing, and opinion writing are accessible in class 11 textbooks. These versions serve as enrichment for students. The class 11 and 12 textbook covers reading content at a moderate to high level.

The second reading genre analyzed was personal reading, which is most typically encountered in English textbooks evaluated. Despite appearing more in the class 10 textbook, this genre has a high and balanced amount in all three textbooks. This personal reading includes greeting cards, invitations, messages, schedules (trains, buses, telephones, and so on), recipes, menus, maps, calendars, advertisements, novels, short stories, jokes, plays, poetry, and medical reports (Brown, 2003). In line with previous study conducted by Sudrajat (Sudrajat, 2020), this genre educates students at the personal comprehension level where each student is allowed to interpret the meaning of the text they are reading. The book focuses more on personal matters, such as personal experiences in everyday life. The
dominating personal reading appears in the class 10 textbook, which includes mentioning identification and communicating with peers in terms of celebrating. Personal reading in the class 10 textbook also includes a sort of short story in the form of folktales. This form of reading material is more entertaining and simpler to grasp for students in class 10 than academic reading. Both in terms of the theme and the degree of words employed. Personal reading begins in textbook class 11 with comprehending reading a personal letter, also known as an informal letter. Students may learn to catch the message included in the letter, comprehend the context, and convey the feeling suggested in the content by reading this personal letter. Other formats of personal reading in this textbook include short folktales, folklore, and play dialogue. Students can obtain moral values that can be implemented in everyday life through the three types of personal reading. Moreover, in textbook class 12, personal reading was more complicated. Personal letters still exist in a more particular form, especially application letters based on advertisements. Students are required to be able to distinguish and compare personal letters that focus on personal letters connected to themselves and personal letters for official purposes. In this textbook, another type of personal reading genre is a message of procedural text. Students are expected to comprehend basic and complicated procedural texts. Furthermore, they are required to be able to record information relating to manual tools and usage advice. To summarize, the personal reading genre in English textbooks for high school seniors is much relevant to personal life. The reading sections are provided sequentially at three levels: easy, medium, and challenging. The content offered is also according to grade level, so it can be said that the portion of reading material is sufficient.

Job-related reading is the third category of reading genre examined and it often comprises letters/e-mails, memos, project reports, calendars, applications, surveys, and financial documents (Brown, 2003). In this study, this genre contains the fewest portions and it is not even included in class 11 and 12 textbooks. There are just two job-related readings in the class 10 textbook. Emails and surveys about the latest aircraft innovations are among the widest range of job-related readings found in textbooks. Both of these types are quite known as part of the workplace, therefore the availability of this reading material has a connection between contextual information and the world of work. Therefore, despite the restricted number, students are required to comprehend job-related reading passages.

The final findings and discussions of the content analysis of reading material in senior high school English textbooks is aligned with Brown's theory of reading genre (Brown, 2003). The three textbooks cover all reading genres (academic reading, personal reading, and job-related reading).

**Reading Skills Portrayed in the Textbooks**

Aside from analyzing reading genres, the research focus in this study, which is also essential, is on reading skills covered in the English textbook for senior high school. In this study, the theory underpinning reading skills was from Brown (Brown, 2003). The final results revealed that the three textbooks examined are consistent with Brown's theory of reading skills, which includes microskills and macroskills. The micro and macroskills reflect a range of possible objectives for assessing reading comprehension. Microskills are the first to be examined for their
availability in the reading material for this study. It often begins by teaching fundamental communication skills such as phonemes, vocabulary, and paraphrasing. This skill allows for the development of abilities in the expression section, grammatical word classes, recognizing fundamental forms of syntax, reconstructing and concluding situations, aims, and participants (Mantra, Widiastuti & Pramawati, 2020). Regarding the summary of data in table 5, it is obvious that the majority of microskills are covered in the three textbooks assessed. The class 10 textbook illustrates nine microskills. Class 10 students are expected to build reading skills on micro components in line with their level. However, microskills are not exclusively taught in class 10 textbooks; class 11 and 12 textbooks also convey microskills adequately, but not as efficiently as class 10 textbooks.

Macroskills, the second skill to be analyzed in the textbooks, occupy a smaller portion than microskills. However, this does not mean that macroskills are not more important for understanding reading material. Indeed, macroskills and microskills are closely related because the expected skills are an extension of the micro component being tested (Hamed, 2017). These macroskills are different from micro skills, the macroskills are paying attention to described events, ideas, discourse, function, reading style, and cohesion (Mantra, Widiastuti & Pramawati, 2020; Brown, 2003). The large percentage of macroskills are reported in class 12 of the three English textbooks examined. In line with the class level, these macroskills are assigned after students are deemed to have sufficient understanding of the microskills in class 10 and 12. Therefore, micro and macro skills are presented in stages in these three textbooks.

Conclusion
This study examines reading material in English textbooks for senior high school students in Indonesia which focuses on reading genres and skills. Personal reading is the most commonly utilized and macroskills are the most frequently presented among the reading genres and skills proposed by Brown (Brown, 2003) in the three textbooks. This implies that textbooks prioritize reading materials that are relevant to and found in students’ daily lives. The academic reading genre is also provided at a sufficient capacity with a degree of comprehension difficulty. In contrast, job-related reading genres are underserved and limited. In terms of reading skills, the three textbooks address both microskills and macroskills. However, macroskills take precedence in these three textbooks. It is reasonable to presume that high school students will proceed through the stages of reading skills. Students are required to grasp macro components of reading material, such as understanding both specific and general information, including coherence and cohesion.

The results of this study may be helpful to textbook authors in terms of the proportion of reading genres and skills. The availability of both reading genres (personal reading, academic reading, job-related reading) and skills (microskills and macroskills) in each textbook chapter will be a breakthrough. Because each chapter in the three textbooks under evaluation only covers one genre and skill. It would be preferable if the two main aspects were presented in a balanced way so that students could obtain a better understanding. The random sequence of
presentation of reading skills in the three textbooks is also feedback to the author so that the latest version of the textbook could be even better.

This study has limitations, so for future research, the researcher suggests more in-depth content analysis not only in the reading material section, but in all aspects of an English textbook.

References


Access article distributed under the terms of the Creative Commons Attribution license (https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-sa/4.0/)
Textbook Oriented to Character Education using Multimodality in College. AL-ISHLAH: Jurnal Pendidikan, 13(1), 283-300.


